

The Role of Wisdom in Multicultural Counselling

H. Herdi, Sunaryo Kartadinata & Agus Taufiq

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia.

Wisdom of multicultural counsellor are important issues as well as interesting in multiculturalcounsellingand psychology. The purpose of this research is to explore the multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates. The survey was employed as the research design. The research participants cover 489 Indonesian counsellor candidates. The Counsellor Wisdom Adjective Scale was used as the data collection method. The exploratory factor analysis was applied as the data analysis techniques. The results show that there are ten dimensions of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates. There are namely: social intelligence, Meta cognitive skills, personal intelligence, emotional intelligence, sagacity, empathy, judgment, tolerance of ambiguity, managing problems and uncertainties, and religious. Further research is needed to assess the dimensions of wisdom according to the perspectives of counsellor educators, counsellors, and counselee to reveal results that are more compact. Implications for counsellor education and supervision program are discussed.

Keywords: Multicultural Counselling, Multicultural Counsellor, Wisdom.

Wisdom becomes a new paradigm and plays an important role for multicultural counsellors, both as individuals and as professionals. In the study by Hanna, Bemak, and Chung (1999) wisdom is seen as the fundamental quality and peak of competence of effective multicultural counsellors. Therefore, multicultural counselling expertise is influenced by wisdom (Phan, Rivera, Volker, & Maddux, 2009). The importance of this topic can be seen from scholars' definition about wisdom. It becomes an essential human characteristic (Osbeck & Robinson, 2005), the culmination of personality development (Staudinger, Dornier, & Mickler, 2005), post-formal thinking skills to find and to solve problems (Arlin, 1990) without causing more complex problems (Hanna & Ottens, 1995). Finally, positive emotions, happiness, and tranquillity (Csikszentmihalyi & Nakamura, 2005), happiness (Bergsma & Ardel, 2012; Le, 2011), and common good (Sternberg, 2005) are good things resulted from wisdom.

What is the importance of wisdom in multicultural counselling? In multicultural counselling, counsellors are constantly confronted by counselees with diverse cultural backgrounds, contradictions, and its complexity

of the problem. In order to be an effective multicultural counsellor, intelligence-only is not enough, it requires wisdom. Intelligence is considered to facilitate the ability to learn theory and practice skills, while wisdom directs the application of knowledge and practice skills in counselling. The integration between intelligence and wisdom will make multicultural counselling more effective. Conversely, if a counsellor has only intelligence without having wisdom, he will be caught up in the "foolishness" behavior, namely: "unrealistic optimism, egocentrism, immune illusion, omnipotence, and omniscience" (Sternberg, 2005b).

Previous studies have shown that the quality of the counsellor's personality is a major determinant of counselling effectiveness rather than the theoretical knowledge and counselling technique approaches used by counsellors (Kartadinata, 2011; Chenault, 1971). In multicultural counselling, wisdom is the fundamental quality and peak of competence of effective multicultural counsellors (Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999). Empirical studies found that 14% of multicultural counselling was influenced by the wisdom of the counsellor

itself (Phan, Rivera, Volker, & Maddux, 2009). Conversely, if a multicultural counsellor has no wisdom, then he will be trapped into foolishness.

There is no agreement on the exact concept and dimensions of wisdom among experts and researchers. However, Jeste, et al., (2010) have made efforts in that direction. Ardeli (2000, 2003, 2004, 2011) argues that "wisdom is a combination or integration of personality characteristics, including: cognitive, reflective, and affective." Other experts argue that wisdom is a multidimensional construct. In the Balance Theory of Wisdom (Sternberg, 1985, 1990, 2001, 2005; Sternberg, Jarvin, & Reznitskaya, 2008) states that wisdom is "the application of tacit knowledge mediated by values... to achieve the common well". Sternberg (1985) finds differences in the concept and characteristics of wisdom based on different professions of respondents. In the Berlin Wisdom Paradigm (Baltes & Smith, 1990; Baltes & Staudinger, 2000; Baltes, Gluck, & Kunzmann, 2005) wisdom is defined as "expert knowledge in basic life pragmatics". According to this theory, wise people are marked by rich in factual and procedural knowledge about life, contextualisation of life span, relativism of values/tolerance, as well as recognition and management of uncertainty.

Cross-cultural studies also find that the concepts and the characteristics of wisdom are defined differently in various cultures and nations. Takahashi (2000) and Takahashi and Overton (2005) mention that the concept of wisdom according to Western culture (American and Australian) emphasizes the cognitive dimension, while Eastern culture (India and Japan) emphasizes the integration of cognitive and affective dimensions. Takahashi and Overton (2002, 2005) study the state of two modes of wisdom, namely analytic and synthetic. The analytic mode tends to be dominant in American culture, whereas the synthetic mode tends to be dominant in Japanese culture. Grossmann, et al., (2012) also argue that young and middle-aged of Japanese people use more wise reasoning strategies than young and middle-aged Americans do.

Yang (2001) states that, according to Chinese-Taiwanese, the concept of wisdom is

composed of four factors, namely competency and knowledge, benevolence and compassion, openness and profundity, and modesty and unobtrusiveness. A study of 41 adult Korean participants conducted by Sung (2011) reveals four types of wisdom, (1) experience-oriented action (2) emotional-oriented sympathy (3) relationship-oriented consideration, and (4) problem-oriented problem solving. In a global perspective, Sanchez-Escobedo, Park, Hollingworth, Misiuniene, and Ivanova (2014) find three main characteristics of a wise person that are charismatic, goal-oriented, and unconventional.

In multicultural counselling, scholars such as Hanna and Ottens (1995) and Hanna, Bemak, and Chung (1995) say that the wisdom of multicultural counsellors consists of two dimensions. The first dimension is cognitive (dialectical reasoning, efficient coping skills, tolerance of ambiguity, perspicacity, problem finding and solving) and metacognition. The second is affective and awareness dimension (empathy, caring, feeling recognition, deotomatization, and sagacity. Moreover, Osterlund (2014) finds six characteristics of counsellor's wisdom; they are reflective attitude, the ability to gain insight from experience, emotional intelligence, cognitive ability, real-world skills, and concern for others. Osterlund (2014) also suggests the importance of further research to construct more comprehensive characteristics of counsellor's wisdom.

The theoretical and empirical studies and researches support the general hypothesis that the concepts and characteristics of wisdom have a wide range, according to the peculiarities of cultural and national contexts. On the other hand, previous theoretical and empirical studies reveal several ideas. Firstly, no agreement has been found on the concepts and characteristics of wisdom. Secondly, there has been no agreement on the concept and characteristics of wisdom of multicultural counsellors. Thirdly, the concepts and characteristics of wisdom are influenced by many factors one of them is culture. Based on this rationale, the study focuses on the characteristics of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates. In short,

this study is to answer the question: How is the empirical profile of wisdom of multicultural counsellor according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates?

Method

Research Design

This research used survey method (Heppner, Wampold, & Kivlighan, 2008). The design was chosen because this study had to describe, explain, or explore the dimensions of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates.

Participants

The research participants are 489 Indonesian counsellor candidates. The participants are counsellor candidates from 11 Guidance and Counselling Departments in Indonesia. The 11 Guidance and Counselling Department are mandated to organize counsellor education program by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education. The 11 Guidance and Counselling Departments also share similarities in their curriculum, especially the nationally agreed curriculum. The curriculum structure generally covers: general courses, basic education courses, field of expertise and supporting courses, and instructional courses. The curriculum structure is aimed at achieving the nationally determined competence of graduates in accordance with the Decree of the Minister of National Education No. 27 of 2008 on Academic Qualification Standards and Counsellor Competences. The details of participants are presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Research Participants

Nr.	Institution	Number of Participant
1	Universitas Negeri Semarang	39
2	Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta	50
3	Universitas Negeri Malang	50
4	Universitas Negeri Jakarta	66
5	Universitas Negeri Makassar	65
6	Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha	28
7	Universitas Prof. Dr. Hamka	58

8	Universitas Ahmad Dahlan	78
9	Universitas Katolik Indonesia Atmajaya	21
10	Universitas Kristen Indonesia	10
11	Universitas Sanata Dharma	24
Total		489

Data Collection Technique

The data collection techniques employed the Counsellor's Wisdom Scale. This scale measured 44 characteristics of counsellor's wisdom: religious, rich in situational knowledge, rich in procedural knowledge, rich in factual knowledge, cognitive regulation, self-transcendence, metacognition, self-integration, self-esteem, self-knowledge, self-adjustment, love of learning, friendly, respect, responsibility, caring, guiding, pro-social, unconditional positive regard, justly, honestly, communicative, forgiving, self-reflection, self-awareness, emotional intelligence, a sense of humour, experienced, sagacity, ethics, and leadership, patience, calmness, empathy, and psychological well-being, reasoning, perspicacity, judgment, tolerance to ambiguity, deotomatization, open-mindedness, values relativism, managing uncertainty, and finding and solving problems.

This scale is a descriptor rating with five point Likert scale: 1 = very unimportant, 2 = unimportant/irrelevant, 3 = quite important/relevant, 4 = important/relevant and 5 = very important/relevant. The validity test by using item-total correlation product moment of Pearson obtained all valid items with $r_{it} > .300$ at $p < .01$. The reliability test used Cronbach's's Alpha and the result obtained was $\alpha = .937$. That is, the instrument is valid and reliable so it can be used and reliable in collecting research data.

Research Procedure

Data collection was done conventionally using paper-and-pencil-based questionnaire by visiting the multicultural counsellor candidates sixth semester in 11 Guidance and Counseling Department in Indonesia on agreed schedule. Multicultural counsellor candidates were asked to answer each statement according to their actual condition by choosing one of the alternative answers provided. The researchers

guaranteed the data confidentiality and its use for research purposes only. After collecting the data, the next step was to verify, process, and analyze research data.

Data Analysis Technique

The exploratory factor analysis technique was used to reduce the 44 characteristics of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates into several factors/components. According to Heppner, Wampold, & Kivlighan (2008), the exploratory factor analysis is used to operationally set data of underlying dimensions. Operationally, the data was processed by using IBM SPSS Statistics version 20.0 for Windows.

Results

The test results show that, from the 44 characteristics of the multicultural counsellor's wisdom, there were 10 dimensions that might be formed with Eigen values value > 1 . The variance can be explained by dimension 1 for 28.969%, dimension 2 for 7.096%, dimension 3 for 4.354%, dimension 4 for 3.430%, dimension 5 for 3.113%, dimension 6 for 2.821%, dimension 7 for 2.563%, dimension 8 for 2.467%, dimension 9 for 2.330%, and dimension 10 for 2.274%. These 10 dimensions will be able to explain the variables of multicultural counsellor's wisdom for 59.417%.

The results show that the KMO value is .931. Bartlett's Test of Sphericity gives an approximate Chi-Square of 8994.667 with Sig.000 $< p$.05. The results also show the value of Measure of Sampling Adequacy (MSA) in Anti-Image Matrices table ranging from .863 - .964 $> p$.05. This means that the variables and samples (dimensions of multicultural counsellor wisdom according to Indonesian counsellor candidates) are possible for further analysis.

The results of exploratory factor analysis by using Principal Component Analysis and Varimax with Kaizer Normalization rotation method indicate that may be formed in 10 dimensions. Determination of each variable that would go into each factor was done by looking at the magnitude of the correlation value between variables with dimensions in Table 2.

Based on Table 2, ten dimensions are the

characteristics of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to Indonesian counsellor candidates. The ten dimensions are as follows.

Dimension 1: friendly, respect, responsibility, caring, guiding, pro-social, unconditional positive regard, justly, honestly, communicative, and forgiving. Dimension 2: rich in situational knowledge, rich in procedural knowledge, rich in factual knowledge, cognitive regulation, self-transcendence, and metacognition. Dimension 3: self-integration, self-esteem, self-knowledge, self-adjustment, and love of learning. Dimension 4: self-reflection, self-awareness, and emotional intelligence. Dimension 5: a sense of humour, experienced, sagacity, ethics, and leadership. Dimension 6: patience, calmness, empathy, and psychological well-being. Dimension 7: reasoning, perspicacity, and judgment. Dimension 8: tolerance to ambiguity and deotomatization. Dimension 9: open-mindedness, values relativism, managing uncertainty, and finding and solving problems. Dimension 10: religious.

These ten dimensions are appropriate to summarize the characteristics of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to Indonesian counsellor candidates because of the correlation $p > .05$.

Discussion

Each culture understands concept and characteristics of wisdom differently. This research has found 10 dimensions of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates. The ten dimensions of multicultural counsellor's wisdom are referred as social intelligence, metacognition skills, emotional intelligence, personal intelligence, sagacity, empathy, judgment, tolerance of ambiguity, managing problems and uncertainty, and religious.

Dimension 1: Social intelligence. Dimension 1 consists of friendly, respect, responsibility, caring, guiding, pro-social, unconditional positive regard, justly, honestly, communicative, and forgiving. The naming of this dimension is based on the opinions of experts and researchers. This dimension is relevant to the experts' opinion that say wisdom can be conceptualized as social

Table 2. Rotated Component Matrix

Characteristics of Multicultural Counsellor's Wisdom	Dimension									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Hospitable	.713									
Appreciate	.688									
Responsible	.687									
Care	.673									
Guide	.661									
Prosocial	.629									
Unconditional positive regard	.594									
Fair	.581				.341					.382
Honest	.563				.356					.336
Communicative	.561									
Forgiving	.510				.330					.367
Rich of situational knowledge		.768								
Rich of procedural knowledge		.760								
Rich of factual knowledge		.720								
Cognitive regulation		.570								
Self-Transcendence		.516						.344		
Metacognition		.514								
Self-integration			.714							
Self-esteem			.700							
Self-knowledge			.618							
Self-adjustment			.573							
Love learning			.470							.402
Self-reflection				.700						
Self-awareness	.335			.668						
Emotional intelligence	.343			.615						
Sense of humour					.698					
Experienced					.583					
Sagacity					.573					
Ethical	.366				.436					
Leadership				.425	.435					
Patience						.669				
Calmness			.348			.646				
Empathy	.377					.577				
Psychological well-being						.403				
Reasoning							.737			
Perspicacity							.684			
Judgment							.508			

Tolerance to ambiguity	.682
Deotomatization	.618
Open-mindedness	.732
Values relativism	.609
Managing uncertainty	.457 .500
Finding and solving problems	.411
Religious	.715

intelligence (Kihlstrom & Cantor, 2011; Levitt & Piazza-Bonin, 2016) and social competence (Yang, 2001).

Therefore, it can be synthesized that the affective dimension of “having emotions and positive behaviour toward others” (Ardelt, 2000, 2003, 2004, 2011), is to “... balance intrapersonal, interpersonal, and extra personal interests to achieve the common good” (Sternberg, 2001). The others include the dimension of prosocial attitudes and values relativism /tolerance (Baltes & Smith, 1990; Baltes & Staudinger, 2000; Baltes, Gluck, & Kunzmann, 2005), altruism (Brown, 2004; Brown & Greene, 2006; Greene & Brown, 2009; Meeks & Jeste, 2009), the affective and awareness dimensions of empathy and concern (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999).

The dimension is also relevant to the findings of previous researches. They are, among others, having high social and interpersonal intelligence (Ivanova & Rascevskaia Sanchez-Escobedo, Park, Hollingworth, Misiuniene, & Ivanova, 2014), social cognition, altruism, empathy, social cooperation, relativism of values/tolerance, tolerance of difference with others, centred on others, humane, grateful, willing to forgive others, the ability to give advice to others, and fair (Jeste, et al., 2010), concern for others (Osterlund, 2014), warm and cooperative (Sanchez-Escobedo, Park, Hollingworth, Misiuniene, & Ivanova, 2014), type-oriented considerations of humanitarian relations (Sung, 2011), benevolence and compassion factors, and openness and profundity (Yang, 2001), as well as helping others and contributing to society (Yang, 2008).

Social intelligence is one of the essential components of wisdom. Social intelligence can be used to understand and enjoy togetherness

with others to achieve a certain goal (Sternberg, 2001). A wise and effective multicultural counsellor will be able to understand and interact effectively and productively with counselees to foster relationships and achieve mutually agreed counselling goals.

Dimension 2: Metacognitive Skills. Dimension 2 consists of rich of situational knowledge, procedural knowledge, factual knowledge, cognitive regulation, self-transcendence, and metacognition. The naming of this dimension is based on the opinions of experts and the findings of previous researches. This dimension is relevant to the opinion of experts such as the cognitive dimensions of wisdom (Ardelt, 2003, 2004, 2011), rich of factual and procedural knowledge about life (e.g. Baltes & Smith, 1990; Baltes & Staudinger, 2000; Baltes, Gluck, & Kunzmann, 2005), metacognitive skills (Brugman, 2006), cognitive skills/processes (Csikszentmihalyi & Rathunde, 1990), cognitive dimensions of metacognition (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999), integrated mind (Labouvie-Vief, 1990), cognitive dimensions of experience and knowledge (Takahashi, 2000; Takahashi & Bordia, 2000), analytic mode (Takahashi & Overton, 2002; Takahashi & Overton, 2005). The naming of this factor is also based on previous research findings, such as cognitive ability (Osterlund, 2014), rich of life knowledge and practical skills about life (Jeste, et al., 2010).

Metacognition is one of the main components of wisdom. Multicultural counsellors with metacognitive skills will have concern for the limitations and forecasts of knowledge, awareness of consciousness, knowing about knowing, thinking about thinking, and intuitive knowledge (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999).

Dimension 3: Personal intelligence. Dimension 3 consists of self-integration, self-esteem, self-knowledge, self-adjustment, and love of learning. The naming of this dimension is based on the experts' opinions and previous research findings, including cognitive dimensions of wisdom (Ardelt, 2003, 2004, 2011), self-knowledge (Brown, 2004; Brown & Greene, 2006; Greene & Brown, 2009), the virtues of the psychosocial critical successes of the stage of "integrity versus despair" personality (Erikson, 1959), recognizing the limitations of self-knowledge, having purpose in life, realism, resilience, life satisfaction, generativity, ego integrity, self-pity (Jeste, et al., 2010), reflective/self-understanding (Meeks & Jeste, 2009), as well as adaptability (Ivanova and Rascevska in Sanchez-Escobedo, Park, Hollingworth, Misiuniene, & Ivanova, 2014).

Personal intelligence is one of the key components of wisdom. Wisdom requires a balance of intrapersonal, interpersonal, and extra personal skills and interests to achieve common good (Sternberg, 2001). So, it is necessary to be multicultural counsellors who have the personal ability know, integrate, respect, adapt, and develop themselves.

Dimension 4: Emotional intelligence. Dimension 4 consists of self-reflection, self-awareness, and emotional intelligence. This dimension is relevant to the opinion of experts who say that one of the dimensions of wisdom is affective dimension (Ardelt, 2003, 2004, 2011), affective/emotional management (Brugman, 2006), emotional management (Brown, 2004; Brown & Greene, 2006; Greene & Brown, 2009), intrinsic pleasure and happiness (Csikszentmihalyi & Rathunde, 1990), affective and conscious dimensions such as empathy and recognition of feelings (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999), dimension of emotional balance (Meeks & Jeste, 2009). Previous researches also show that emotional prowess is one of the dimensions of wisdom, such as emotional-oriented type of sympathy (Sung, 2011), synthetic modes for instance, emotional empathy and emotional regulation (Takahashi & Overton, 2002, 2005), emotional intelligence (Osterlund, 2014), emotional regulation (Jeste, et al., 2010; Webster, 2003,

2007), and benevolence and compassion (Yang, 2001).

Emotional intelligence is an important part of wisdom. Emotional intelligence is the ability to understand, measure, and manage emotions (Mayer & Salovey, 1993; Sternberg, 2001). Multicultural counsellors with high emotional intelligence will be able to understand, accept, use, and manage their own and counselees' emotions to remain calm and patient in dealing with potentially problematic and uncertain counselling, problems, and situations.

Dimension 5: Sagacity. Dimension 5 consists of a sense of humour, experience, sagacity, ethics, and leadership. This dimension is relevant to the experts' opinion and the findings of previous researches that the dimensions of wisdom cover sagacity (Sternberg, 1985, 1990; Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999), leadership, life knowledge, life skills (Meeks & Jeste, 2009), cognitive and affective dimensions (Takahashi, 2000; Takahashi & Bordia, 2000), sense of humour and experience (Webster, 2003, 2007), experience-oriented action type (Sung, 2011), as well as openness to experience, sense of humour, maturity as the result of experience, and ethical behaviour (Jeste, et al., 2010).

Sagacity is skill for listening, deep understanding, and awareness of humanity and human relations, and learning from mistakes (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999). A wise and effective multicultural counsellor has the ability to listen carefully when counselee expresses thoughts, feelings, and experiences. A wise and effective multicultural counsellor also has a deep understanding of motives, needs, expectations, values, beliefs, views of life and counsel so that the counsellor has an awareness of humanity and human relationships with the counselee. A wise and effective multicultural counsellor is also able to learn from the mistakes they have made.

Dimension 6: Empathy. Dimension 6 consists of patience, calm, empathy, and psychological well-being. This dimension is based on the experts' opinions and the findings of previous studies. It is known that the dimension of wisdom covers empathy (Hanna &

Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999; Jeste, et al., 2010; Pascual-Leone, 1990), the affective dimensions of wisdom (Ardelt, 2000, 2003, 2004, 2011), synthetic modes/emotional empathy (Takahashi & Overton, 2002; Takahashi & Overton, 2005), affective (Brugman, 2006), and emotional-oriented sympathy (Sung, 2011).

Empathy is one of the important aspects of wisdom. It is an effective prerequisite, essential condition, and core competencies for multicultural counsellors. Empathy in counselling scene is a counsellor's substantive, basic, additive, and subtractive behaviour towards counselee behaviour accurately (Ivey, Ivey, & Zalaquett, 2010). Highly empathetic counsellors have sensitivity and are able to accept unconditional counselee (Rogers, 1975). Highly empathetic counsellors are able to understand counselee from the perspective and feelings of the counselee. They also communicate understanding with the aim of helping counsees to better understand themselves and overcome the problems they face (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999; Ivey, Ivey, & Zalaquett, 2010); to build more effective help behaviours; and to avoid the psychological barriers that arise in the counselling process (Wang, et al., 2003).

Dimension 7: Judgment. Dimension 7 consists of reasoning, perspicacity, and judgment. This dimension is based on the experts' opinion and previous research findings that state that scales is one of the dimensions of wisdom, such as judgment, reasoning ability, quick information use, and perspicacity (Sternberg, 1985; 1990), reflective reasoning (Kitchener & Brenner, 1990; Sternberg, 1985, 1990), judgment (Brown, 2004; Brown & Greene, 2006; Greene & Brown, 2009), goal oriented (Sanchez-Escobedo, Park, Hollingworth, Misiuniene, & Ivanova, 2014), dialectal reasoning and perspicacity (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999), and using a wise reasoning strategy (Grossmann, et al., 2012).

Dimension 8: Tolerance to ambiguity. Dimension 8 consists of tolerance to ambiguity and deotomatization. The naming of this dimension is based on the ideas that tolerance to ambiguity is one of the dimensions of

wisdom, such as tolerance for ambiguity and deotomatization (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999), comfortable with ambiguity (Sternberg, 1990), introduction and management uncertainty and ambiguity effectively and tolerance to ambivalence (Jeste, et al., 2010), and unconventional and creative (Sanchez-Escobedo, Park, Hollingworth, Misiuniene, & Ivanova, 2014).

Wise and effective multicultural counsellors need to have the skills to be tolerant of ambiguity. Counsellors with the ability to tolerate high ambiguity will be able to recognize ambiguity as the intrinsic essence of humanity and its interaction with others and the environment and be able to accept, integrate, and respect the mixture (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999). Aside from having characteristic of a wise person, tolerant of ambiguity is an indicator of creativity and creative people (Sternberg, 2005). A wise and creative counsellor will be able to respect the different views and culture with counselee. A wise and creative counsellor will be free of thoughts, feelings, and behaviours oriented only on one side between "positive-negative", "good-bad", or "black and white" in interacting and counselling relationships and living lives.

Dimension 9: Managing problems and uncertainties. Dimension 9 consists of open-mindedness, relativism values, managing uncertainty, and finding and solving problems. This dimension is relevant to experts' and researchers' opinion that one of the wisdom dimensions is the management of problems and uncertainties. Some ideas cover the art of problem finding (Arlin, 1990), the type of problem-oriented attachment (Sung, 2011), the introduction and management of uncertainty (Baltes & Smith, 1990; Baltes & Staudinger, 2000; Brown, 2004; Brown & Greene, 2006; Greene & Brown, 2009; Meeks & Jeste, 2009), reflective dimensions of wisdom (Ardelt, 2000, 2003, 2004, 2011), behavioural dimensions such as acting appropriately in uncertainty (Brugman, 2006), making decisions, solving problems, working correctly in diversity (Yang, 2008), efficient coping skills, finding and solving problems, and tolerance of ambiguity (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999), real-world

skills (Osterlund, 2014), practical skills about life, pragmatic decision-making, and good coping strategies (Jeste, et al., 2010).

The important role of wisdom is the art of finding and solving problems (Arlin, 1990). A wise and effective multicultural counsellor has the ability to identify, redefine, reorganize, find alternatives, set solutions priorities, solve problem, and face situations without causing more complex problems (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999).

Dimension 10: Religious. The concepts and dimensions of wisdom are often found in religious teachings, either Islam, Christianity, Hinduism, Buddhism, Taoism Confucianism, etc. In the tradition of Islamic Sufism, Ibn 'Arabi say that a wise person is one who attains the ma'rifat level, which is, to have knowledge of God's truth (Frager, 1999; Geoffroy, 2006). In Christianity, wisdom is "to follow divine wisdom and recognize the goodness of God to be the cause of all things" (Robinson, 1990). For Hinduism, a wise individual is characterized by the attainment of spirituality and insight. For Buddhists, wisdom is knowledge of something gained through personal observation and experience. According to this teaching, spirituality and observation are the main components of wisdom. The core of wisdom in the teachings of Taoism covers intuition and compassion. Meanwhile, the wisdom in Confucianism focuses on morality and righteous living. A wise person is "the one who knows, knowing something that is known and unknown" (Birren & Svensson, 2005).

From this research, clearly that wisdom as an elusive psychological construct (Sternberg, 1990; Takahashi & Overton, 2005) found in many cultures (Lee, Choun, Aldwin, & Levenson, 2015), wisdom must be considered for full understanding (Yang, 2001). Gluck and Bluck (2011) find that one's wisdom is related to, and its development is affected by, life experiences. Sanchez-Escobedo, Park, Hollingworth, Misiuniene, and Ivanova (2014) state that there are three assumptions about wisdom and culture. "Wisdom is influenced by perceptions, values, and experiences in cultural contexts; the concept of wisdom is specific in a culture of wisdom; and there is a core of human values."

Wisdom is influenced, formed, and developed by, and can only be interpreted in, cultural context in which the counsellor resides. Different cultural contexts will influence the differences in meaning and put emphasis on the meaning of the nature of wisdom. The characteristics of wise counsellors will be different also. Culture can influence one's thoughts, feelings, and behaviours, including "wise" or "foolishness" counsellors. Therefore, Birren and Svensson(2005) mention the importance of research to operate and to measure the concepts and the characteristics of more multidimensional wisdom across religions, cultures, and nations.

Although wisdom occupies a vital role in multicultural life and counselling, it tends to be neglected in education. Therefore, it is necessary to reform education, especially with regard to vision and purpose for the 21st century. Indeed, the main vision and goals of education (including psychologist, psychotherapist, teacher, and counsellor education) are to develop wisdom of learners (including wisdom of psychologist, psychotherapist, teacher, and multicultural counsellor candidates) (Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999; Jones, 2015; Levitt & Piazza-Bonin, 2016; Lunenberg & Korthagen, 2009; Marshall & Thorburn, 2013; Ozolins, 2015; Sternberg, 2013).

Wisdom can develop dynamically through experience and education (Brown, 2004; Frantz, 2014). In counsellor education and supervision programs, wisdom of aspiring multicultural counsellors can flourish if they are given the opportunity to question, reflect, internalize, and integrate their experiences (Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999) in both personal and professional experiences. This activity can be facilitated by counselor educators through supervision activities.

There are six principles of wise multicultural counselling that must be considered in counsellor education and supervision program. "First, the counsellor should learn how to be comfortable with the ambiguity within himself in order to understand the condition of the counselee. Second, the counsellor must learn how to interact and experience intimate, vulnerable, and co-dependent relationships so that he/

she can better understand the patterns of the counsellee's relationship and navigate the relationship better. Third, the counsellor needs to explore, empower, and advocate the authority of the counsellee in the face of ambiguity and uncertainty in a secure relationship. Fourth, wise multicultural counselling requires openness to adapt counselling practices to the characteristics of each counsellee. Fifth, acceptance in a therapeutic relationship can help the counsellee develop self-acceptance and self-awareness, as important as change. Finally, wise multicultural counselling needs empirical support so that interventions can be adjusted creatively and flexibly according to the characteristics and conditions of the counsellee" (adapted from Levitt & Piazza-Bonin, 2016).

Conclusion

The present study has found 10 dimensions of multicultural counsellor's wisdom according to the perspective of Indonesian counsellor candidates. There are namely: social intelligence, metacognition skills, personal intelligence, sagacity, emotional intelligence, empathy, judgment, tolerance of ambiguity, managing problems and uncertainties, and religious.

Some of the implications of this research for practices are presented as follows. First, effective multicultural counsellor requires wisdom. The importance of wisdom of multicultural counsellors is supported by the facts of 21st century influences and the future of society that are becoming plural and multicultural. This condition has always faced multicultural counsellors on the dilemmas and conflicts involving counsellee interests vs. personal interests, opportunity vs. threats, harmony vs. conflict, certainty vs. uncertainty.

Second, the counselor education curriculum needs to "provide a core program to strengthen the personal qualities of counsellor" (Kartadinata, 2011) including multicultural counsellor's wisdom (Hanna & Ottens, 1995; Hanna, Bemak, & Chung, 1999; Phan, Rivera, Volker, & Maddux, 2009; Osterlund, 2014, 2016). Third, counsellor educators in counsellor education and supervision programs need to consider and facilitate the development of wisdom of multicultural counsellors candidates. The

main principle of counselor education to develop wisdom is to provide the widest possible opportunity for multicultural counsellor candidates to gain concrete experience and practice in authentic settings, asking questions, gaining practical experience in authentic settings, reflecting, integrating, internalizing, and transforming their experiences in scenes of multicultural counselling and life. In other words, multicultural counsellor candidates "become more personally involved with diverse population" (Sharf, 2012).

This research needs to be followed up with relevant researches to produce results that are more compact. Firstly, the next research may examine the wisdom dimensions of multicultural counsellors based on the perspectives of counsellors, counsellor educators, and counsellee from diverse ethnics, cultures, educational backgrounds, religious affiliations, genders, and ages. Secondly, wisdom is not stagnant. It develops dynamically. Therefore, further studies of the factors that influence the development of the multicultural wisdom of counsellors are necessary. Thirdly, the measurement of the wisdom dimensions needs to use a performance assessment type in addition to self-assessment. Finally, it develops and examines intervention models to develop the wisdom of multicultural counsellors candidates in counselor education and supervision programs.

References

- Ardelt, M. (2000). Intellectual versus wisdom-related knowledge: The case for a different kind of learning in the later years of life. *Educational Gerontology, 26*, 771-789.
- Ardelt, M. (2003). Empirical assessment of a three-dimensional wisdom scale. *Research on Aging, 23*(3), 275-324.
- Ardelt, M. (2003). Empirical assessment of a three-dimensional wisdom scale. *Research on Aging, 47*, 275-324.
- Ardelt, M. (2004). Wisdom as expert knowledge system: A critical review of a contemporary operationalization of an Ancient concept. *Human Development, 37*(2), 257-285.
- Ardelt, M. (2011). The measurement of wisdom: A commentary on Taylor, Bates, and Webster's comparison of the SAWS and 3D-WS. *Journal*

- of *Experimental and Aging Research*, 37(2), 241-255.
- Arlin, P. K. (1990). Wisdom: The art of problem finding. In R.J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 230-243). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Baltes, P. B., & Smith, J. (1990). Toward a psychology of wisdom and its ontogenesis. In R. J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 87-141). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Baltes, P. B., & Staudinger, U. M. (2000). Wisdom: A metaheuristic (pragmatic) to orchestrate mind and virtue toward excellence. *American Psychologist*, 55(1), 122-136.
- Baltes, P. B., Gluck, J., & Kunzmann, U. (2005). Wisdom: Its structure and function in regulating successful life span. In C. R. Snyder, & S. J. Lopez, *Handbook of positive psychology* (pp. 327-347). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bergsma, A., & Ardelt, M. (2012). Self-reported wisdom and happiness: An empirical investigation. *Journal of Happiness Studies*, 13(1), 481-499.
- Birren, J.E., & Svensson, C.M. (2005). Wisdom in history. In R.J. Sternberg, *A handbook of wisdom: Psychological perspectives* (pp. 1-31). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brown, S. C. (2004). Learning across the campus: How college facilitates the development of wisdom. *Journal of College Student Development*, 42(2), 134-148.
- Brown, S. C., & Greene, J. A. (2006). The wisdom development scale: Translating the conceptual to the concrete. *Journal of College Student Development*, 47(1), 1-19.
- Brugman, G. M. (2006). Wisdom and aging. In J. E. Birren, & K. W. Schaie, *Handbook of the psychology of aging* (pp. 445-476). Amsterdam: Elsevier.
- Chenault, J. (1971). A proposed model for a humanistic counselor education. In C. E. Beck, *Philosophical guidelines for counseling* (pp. 343-349). Dubuque, Iowa: WM.C. Brown Company Publishers.
- Csikszentmihalyi, M., & Nakamura, J. (2005). The role of emotions in the development of wisdom. In R. J. Sternberg, & J. Jordan, *A handbook of wisdom: Psychological perspectives* (pp. 220-243). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Csikszentmihalyi, M., & Rathunde, K. (1990). The psychology of wisdom: An evolutionary interpretation. In R.J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 25-51). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Erikson, E. H. (1959). *Identity and the life cycle*. New York: International University Press.
- Fragar, R. (1999). *Heart, self, & soul: The sufi psychology of growth*. Wheaton, USA: The Theosophical Publishing House.
- Frantz, G. (2014). Wisdom: Experience or education? *Psychological Perspectives*, 57(1), 1-3.
- Geoffroy, E. (2006). Approaching sufism. In E. Geoffroy, *Sufism: Love & wisdom* (pp. 49-61). Canada: World Wisdom, Inc.
- Gluck, J., & Bluck, S. (2011). Laypeople's conceptions of wisdom and its development: Cognitive and integrative views. *The Journals of Gerontology: Series B*, 321-324.
- Greene, J. A., & Brown, S. C. (2009). The wisdom development scale: Further validity investigations. *International Journal of Aging and Human Development*, 68(4), 289-320.
- Grossmann, I., Karasawa, M., Izumi, S., Na, J., Varnum, M.E., Kitayama, S., & Nisbett, R.E. (2012). Aging and wisdom: Cultural matters. *Psychological Science*, 23(10), 1059-1066.
- Hanna, F. J., & Ottens, A.J. (1995). The role of wisdom in psychotherapy. *Journal of Psychotherapy Integration*, 5(1), 195-219.
- Hanna, F.J., Bemak, F., & Chung, R. C.-Y. (1999). Toward a new paradigm for multicultural counseling. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 77(2), 125-134.
- Heppner, P.P., Wampold, B.E., & Kivlighan, D.M. (2008). *Research design in counseling*. USA: Thomson Brooks/Cole.
- Ivey, A.E., Ivey, M.B., & Zalaquett, C.P. (2010). *Intentional interviewing & counseling: Facilitating client development in a multicultural society*. Belmont, USA: Brooks/Cole, Cengage Learning.
- Jeste, D.V., Jeste, D.V., Ardelt, M., Blazer, D., Kraemer, H.C., Vaillant, G., & Meeks, T.W. (2010). Expert consensus on characteristics of wisdom: A delphi method study. *Gerontologist*, 50(1), 668-680.
- Jones, W. E. (2015). Wisdom as an aim of higher education. *Journal of Value Inquiry*, 49, 1-15.
- Kartadinata, S. (2011). *Menguak tabir bimbingan dan konseling sebagai upaya pedagogis*. Bandung, Indonesia: UPI Press.
- Kihlstrom, J. F., & Cantor, N. (2011). *Social intelligence*.

- In R.J. Sternberg, *Handbook of intelligence* (pp. 359-379). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kitchener, K.S., & Brenner, H.G. (1990). Wisdom and reflective judgment: Knowing in the face of uncertainty. In R.J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 212-229). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Labouvie-Vief, G. (1990). Wisdom as integrated thought: Historical and developmental perspectives. In R.J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 52-83). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Le, T. N. (2011). Life satisfaction, openness value, self-transcendence, and wisdom. *Journal of Happiness Studies*, 12, 171-182.
- Lee, S., Choun, S., Aldwin, C. M., & Levenson, M. R. (2015). Cross-cultural comparison of self-transcendent wisdom between the United States and Korea. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Gerontology*, 6(2), 143-161.
- Levitt, H. M., & Piazza-Bonin, E. (2016). Wisdom and psychotherapy: Studying expert therapist' clinical wisdom to explicate common process. *Psychotherapy Research*, 6(2), 31-47.
- Lunenburg, M., & Korthagen, F. A. (2009). Experience, theory, and practical wisdom in teaching and teacher education. *Journal Teachers and Teaching*, 15(2), 225-240.
- Marshall, A., & Thorburn, M. (2013). Cultivating practical wisdom as education. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 1-13.
- Mayer, J. D., & Salovey, P. (1993). The intelligence of emotional intelligence. *Intelligence*, 17(4), 433-442.
- Meeks, T.W., & Jeste, D.V. (2009). Neuroiology of wisdom: A literature overview. *Archives of General Psychiatry*, 66(4), 355-365.
- Osbeck, R.M., & Robinson, D.N. (2005). Philosophical theories of wisdom. In R.J. Sternberg, & J. Jordan, *A handbook of wisdom: Psychological perspectives* (pp. 61-83). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Osterlund, L.C. (2014). Wisdom in the helping relationship. *Jesuit Higher Education*, 32(2), 74-84.
- Osterlund, L.C. (2016). Developing wisdom in counselors of the future: Ignatian pedagogy applied to counselor education and supervision. *VISTAS Online*, 1-11.
- Ozolins, J.T. (2015). Reclaiming paedeia in an age of crises: Education and the necessity of wisdom. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 47(9), 870-882.
- Pascual-Leone, J. (1990). An essay on wisdom: toward organismic processes that make it possible. In R.J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 244-278). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Phan, L.T., Rivera, E.T., Volker, M., & Maddux, C. D. (2009). Wisdom in multicultural counseling: In omitted ingredient. *Interamerican Journal of Psychology*, 43(1), 154-161.
- Robinson, D.N. (1990). Wisdom through the ages. In R.J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 13-24). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Rogers, C. R. (1975). Empathic: An upreacited way of being. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 5(2), 2-10.
- Sanchez-Escobedo, P., Park, K., Hollingworth, L., Misiuniene, J., & Ivanova, L. (2014). Cross-comparative international study on the concept of wisdom. *Gifted Education International*, 30(3), 228-236.
- Sharf, R. S. (2012). *Theories of psychotherapy and counseling: Concept and cases*. USA: Brooks/Cole.
- Staudinger, U.M., Dörner, J., & Mickler, C. (2005). Wisdom and personality. In R.J. Sternberg, & J. Jordan, *A handbook of wisdom: Psychological perspectives* (pp. 191-219). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sternberg, R. (1985). Implicit theory of intelligence, creativity, and wisdom. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 49(3), 607-627.
- Sternberg, R.J. (1990). Understanding wisdom. In R.J. Sternberg, *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development* (pp. 3-9). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sternberg, R.J. (2001). Why schools should teach for wisdom: The balance theory of wisdom. *Educational Psychologist*, 36(4), 227-245.
- Sternberg, R.J. (2005). Foolishness. In R.J. Sternberg, & J. Jordan, *A handbook of wisdom: Psychological perspectives* (pp. 331-350). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sternberg, R.J. (2005). WISC: A model of positive educational leadership comprising wisdom, intelligence, and creativity synthesized. *Educational Psychology Review*, 17(3), 191-262.

- Sternberg, R.J. (2005b). Foolishness. In R.J. Sternberg, & J. Jordan, A handbook of wisdom: Psychological perspectives (pp. 331-352). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sternberg, R.J. (2013). Reform education: Teach wisdom and ethics. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 94(7), 44-47.
- Sternberg, R.J., Jarvin, L., & Reznitskaya, A. (2008). Teaching for wisdom through history: Infusing wise thinking skills in the school curriculum. In M. Ferrari, & G. Potworowski, Teaching for wisdom: Cross-cultural perspectives on fostering wisdom (pp. 37-57). USA: Springer.
- Sung, K. (2011). Exploring wisdom in the Korean elderly: A Q methodology study. *Asian Nursing Research*, 15(2), 128-140.
- Takahashi, M. (2000). Towarda a culturally inclusive understanding of wisdom: Historical roots in the East and West. *The International Journal of Aging and Human Development*, 51(3), 217-230.
- Takahashi, M., & Bordia, P. (2000). The concept of wisdom: A cross-cultural comparison. *International Journal of Psychology*, 35(1), 1-9.
- Takahashi, M., & Overton, W. F. (2002). Wisdom: A culturally inclusive developmental perspective. *International Journal of Behavioral Development*, 269-277.
- Takahashi, M., & Overton, W. F. (2005). Cultural foundations of wisdom: An integrated development approach. In R.J. Sternberg, & J. Jordan, A handbook of wisdom: Psychological perspectives (pp. 32-60). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wang, Y.E., Davidson, M.M., Yakushko, O. F., Savoy, H.B., Tan, J.A., & Bleier, J.K. (2003). The scale of ethnocultural empathy: Development, validation, and reliability. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 221-234.
- Webster, J. D. (2003). An exploratory analysis of a self-assessed wisdom scale. *Journal of Adult Development*, 65(2), 13-22.
- Webster, J. D. (2007). Measuring the character strength of wisdom. *The International Journal of Aging and Human Development*, 163-183.
- Yang, S. Y. (2001). Conceptions of wisdom among Taiwanese Chinese. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 32, 662-680.
- Yang, S. Y. (2008). Real-life contextual manifestations of wisdom. *International Journal of Aging and Human Development*, 273-303.

H. Herdi, Guidance and Counseling Department, Universitas Negeri Jakarta/Guidance and Counseling Department, Graduate School, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia. email: herdiunj5@student.upi.edu. (Corresponding Author)

Sunaryo Kartadinata, Educational Psychology and Guidance Department, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia, email: skartadinata@upi.edu

Agus Taufiq, Educational Psychology and Guidance Department, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Bandung, Indonesia, email: afiq@upi.edu